INTERNATIONAL SEMINAR

SECTORIAL DIALOGUES

EUROPEAN UNION

BRAZIL

ON COMBATING HUMAN TRAFFICKING

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

www.dialogossetoriais.org
EU-BRAZIL SECTOR DIALOGUES ON COMBATING HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Background

The initiative for this Sector Dialogue project was taken by the ministries comprising the quadripartite coordinating unit responsible for the policy for combating human trafficking: the Ministry of Justice, the Secretariat for Women’s Policies and the Human Rights Secretariat, with support provided by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

The opportunity for exchanging experiences at the technical and political level with the European Union arose from the call for proposals for the Sector Dialogues Project managed jointly by the EU and Brazil’s Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management.

It is worth noting that the subject of combating human trafficking has already been addressed in the context of the Brazil/EU political dialogues on human rights.

For the present Seminar, the Ministry of Justice, the Secretariat for Women’s Policies and the Human Rights Secretariat jointly prepared an agenda with a remit which would allow an exchange of experience with the different agencies of the EU, as well as with the Government of Belgium. The main aims were to identify points of mutual interest which would help to enhance the dialogue and to enable participants to gain knowledge of the joint EU public policies regarding the prevention and repression of human trafficking and care for victims. With the second phase brought to a close with the present Seminar, it is hoped that the dialogue on human trafficking can henceforth be deepened and that joint strategies can be formulated for combating this crime.

The project was presented under the aegis of the Ministry of Justice and approved by the Delegation of the European Union in Brazil.

“This is a problem of concern to many countries around the world, especially the European Community. Combating this crime is not simply an internal matter for our country. Without well-founded international understanding and a truly joint effort to combat this crime it will not be possible to find a solution.”

José Eduardo Cardozo
Minister of Justice
Objective
The aim of this seminar was to promote an exchange of experiences between Brazilian Government and European Union public officials with a view to enhancing the knowledge and know-how of those engaged in the prevention and repression of human trafficking, and in care for the victims.

General Information
Date: May 31 and June 1, 2012
Venue: Palácio da Justiça - Auditório Tancredo Neves, Esplanada dos Ministérios, Bloco T, Brasilia-DF
Duration: 16 hours
Participants: 175
Target audience: MPF, DPF, DPRF, CNJ, CNMP, STJ, DPU, MTE, CNJq, CONATRAE, AGU, SENASP, SDH, SPM, COCIT-MRE, DDH-MRE, DAC-MRE, ABIN, ANAMATRA, AMAGIS, AJD, AJURIS, OAB, EMBASSIES (EU), MERCOSUL (core authorities and political, institutional, legal and social division)
Public Office to Combat Human Trafficking (NETP, in Portuguese) and Advanced Post for Humanized Assistance to Migrants (PAAHM, in Portuguese).

The seminar panels sought to identify common ground between Brazil and the EU for deepening the dialogue on this subject, exchanging experiences and looking for further ways of cooperating in the future. The presentations focused on the following:

- exchanging knowledge and experiences regarding projects and activities undertaken in the different countries;
- a high level dialogue, especially in the light of the available literature and the conceptual achievements already in evidence in EU countries;
- the partnerships and specific agreements between the institutional partners directly involved in the subject;
- discussion of activities that could be potentially developed by Brazil and the EU in response to the main dilemmas generated by this subject.
Summary of Panels

Panel 1: Policies for Combating Human Trafficking

Coordinator: Rodrigo Vitória, UNODC Representative in Brazil.

Rodrigo Vitória said that policies had evolved substantially in Brazil with the implementation of the I and II NATIONAL PLAN FOR ADDRESSING HUMAN TRAFFICKING. The second of these, in which 18 ministries participated, was more wide-ranging, and could serve as a basis for EU countries to define new types of approach. On the other hand, the European Union had made more progress than Brazil in terms of international legal cooperation, such as in the case of EUROJUST. This type of networked cooperation could provide a model for Brazil to improve its performance in legal cooperation matters.

Panel 2: Human Trafficking Crime Data Collection System

Coordinated by Natalie Jellinek, Representative of the European Union Delegation in Brazil, this panel presented three models of crime data collection. Two of these originated from the EU: one from ICMPD and the other from Portugal’s Observatory on Trafficking in Human Beings. Dra. Nilce Cunha, General-Procurator for Citizens’ Rights, commented that “you cannot combat that which you know little about”. This remark served as a benchmark for the panel, which concurred that while data was indeed in short supply, data collection was also in its infancy - a challenge posed to EU countries and Brazil alike. The panel also highlighted the risks incurred in data interpretation, particularly concerning data that could be regarded as subjective. Another problem was the lack of coordination between the responsible agencies at national and international levels. The Panel agreed that cooperation mechanisms needed to be established for integrating and standardizing data collection systems.
Panel 3: Police Intelligence

Coordination: André Fagundes Mendes, Coordinator of Intelligence in the National Public Safety Secretariat (SENASP) of the Brazilian Ministry of Justice. One of the main points addressed by this panel was the need for police forces to adopt common practices under the aegis of Police Cooperation. A further point which drew comment was the scarcity of data and the reluctance to share data. Good practices needed to be followed in order to enhance the usefulness of the information available.

Panel 4: Compensation policies for victims of human trafficking

Coordinated by Luiz Machado, ILO Representative in Brazil, this panel highlighted the different scenarios and circumstances between Europe and Brazil. The Ministry of Labor and Employment (MTE) Representative, Renato Bignami, spoke briefly about the compensation policy for Brazilian workers rescued from conditions analogous to slavery, and described the legal framework under which these workers are given formal employment contracts allowing them access to all the usual labor rights. Workers also receive, as a mandatory right, three months of unemployment pay to discourage reincidence, and are granted priority in the Bolsa Familia Program, as well as being eligible to join certain rehabilitation/training programs. Isabel Burke, of the Portuguese Embassy in Brasilia, addressed the question of globalization of the crime of human trafficking, referring particularly to the shrinking of distances made possible by shorter air travel times, which tended to facilitate the illegal movement of trafficked persons. Isabel also referred to the Brazil-Portugal Cooperation Program, while questioning the global ILO estimate of victims of forced labor involving human trafficking. These estimated figures, she said, were in fact too low, given that individuals who were subjected to slave labor were not always recorded as being victims of human trafficking. Finally, after referring to a number of agreements on the subject, she mentioned that in Portuguese legislation prostitution was not a criminal offence, but sexual exploitation was. According to the Belgian representatives, Johan Hongenaert and Ilse Hulsbosch, Belgium’s compensation policy was to provide assistance to victims of human trafficking or forced labor by granting temporary or work visas. This was a multidisciplinary task involving the government and the assistance/care centers based on three main lines of approach: legal, migratory and psychosocial.
Clívia Rubia, from the NGO Casa Brasil-Holanda, said that the organization’s activities had expanded due to the increasing demand by victims of human trafficking, principally victims of sexual abuse. Clívia went on to describe the JOANA project targeted at victims of human trafficking and domestic violence, adding that Government authorities were regularly involved in organizing training sessions on the subject. The panel concluded that victims were often reluctant to denounce the perpetrators of the crime of human trafficking and that efforts were therefore needed to provide the right kind of conditions for victims to do so.

**Panel 5: Care and safe return of victims of human trafficking**

George Lima, SDH International Adviser, coordinated Panel 5. Of the 4 speakers, the first, Counsellor Aloysio Gomide, gave a presentation on the work of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MRE) in terms of consular care for victims of human trafficking, drawing attention to Brazil’s network of consulates, the role of MRE representatives in the protection of Brazilian citizens abroad and MRE’s concern to Formulate a policy to meet the needs of Brazilian communities abroad. The next speaker, Ana Teresa, described the policies adopted by the Secretariat for Women’s Policies focused on protecting women from all forms of violence, and highlighting the direct role played by the states, municipalities and SPM in this subject and the public amenities available for ership for caring for women returning from countries where they had been trafficked to. Dra. Fernanda dos Anjos pointed to the significant role played by the anti-human trafficking nuclei and posts as one of the key policies adopted by the Ministry of Justice, especially the National Justice Secretariat, for combating the problem of human trafficking, and underscored the importance of involving the states and municipalities.

Finally, Mônica Pereira, president of the NGO Abraço, which works with the Brazilian community and other Portuguese-speaking people in Belgium, described the situation lived by people at the sharp end of the human trafficking problem, drawing particular attention to the situation of those forced into sexual slavery.

Paulo Abrão brought the Seminar to a close, expressing appreciation for the valuable partnership forged between the Brazilian Government and the European Union and drawing attention to the opportunities for further cooperation that had been discussed in the panels. Paulo added that this event was the first to be organized by the new Human Trafficking Coordinator, Mariana Carvalho.
Results

A number of key points emerged from the Seminar discussions: a more substantial level of mutual interest in pursuing further dialogue, reciprocal interest in further cooperation and information-sharing by those concerned with the problems of human trafficking, and in the creation of coherent and harmonious public policies designed to reduce the incidence of this crime on the Brazil-Europe route.

One of the key points of consensus at the Seminar was the need for the authorities to encourage all the parties involved in the Federal Government agencies in Brazil and representatives abroad to be aware of the need to defend human rights, to repress and prevent human trafficking and to pay special attention to the plight of the victims.

Furthermore, the Seminar served to update participants’ knowledge of the profile of the kind of Brazilians (male and female) who were particularly at risk in the European Union. The Seminar was judged to be useful for fine-tuning policies related to preventing human trafficking and providing care for the victims of the same.

The booklet “Guidance for Working Abroad” was launched at the Seminar. This aims to alert professional people such as models, footballers, etc to the risks involved in emigration and, particularly, in human trafficking.

The Seminar also made a contribution to strengthening the broad strategic partnership between Brazil and the European Union, as well as enhancing international cooperation in the area of human trafficking. The event provided an opportunity to exchange information, to gain personal insights on the main problems involved in the question of human trafficking in Brazil and the EU, and to discuss the requirements and allay the misgivings of all parties involved. In this respect the Seminar provided an ideal framework for pursuing Brazil-EU discussions on this particular subject and made it possible to establish a more transparent channel of communication between the parties involved. This will be of great value when pursuing agreements and partnerships in the future.

General assessment of the event

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OK</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MINISTERIO DA JUSTICA
Esplanada dos Ministerios, Palacio da Justica, Bloco T, Ed. Sede, Brasilia/DF
This summary was produced under the aegis of the Project for Combating Human Trafficking - BRA/11/X63, of the National Justice Secretariat (SNJ), in partnership with the UN Office for Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the Brazilian Cooperation Agency (ABC)

NATIONAL JUSTICE SECRETARIAT (SNJ)

Secretary of the SNJ Paulo Abrão

Director of the Department of Justice, Classification, Titles and Qualification
Fernanda Alves dos Anjos

Coordinator for Combating Human Trafficking
Mariana S. de Carvalho Oliveira

UNODC Brazil Projects Manager
Rodrigo Vitória

Technical Review
Tatiana Tutida

Author and Graphic Design
Sady Fauth